Accessing literature on the Bahá’í Faith: emerging search technologies and recent results

Graham Hasall
Suva, University of the South Pacific

Abstract
This article surveys some current search technologies that can be used to find documentation on the Bahá’í religion, and provides a summary of results of such searches for the period 2003-2006. It suggests that increase in the capacity to search in the past three decades has increased at a phenomenal pace. Search technologies have multiplied and become more effective and more accessible. More data has become accessible. Emphasis has shifted from seeking information toward making best use of the information found. Deeper access to information has expanded the range of research questions that we may dare to ask.

Access to literature relating to the Bahá’í religion and its emerging global community has expanded phenomenally with the advent of new communications technologies. Scholarly literature is appearing in academic presses, in Bahá’í-sponsored or affiliated presses, in the media, and on the Internet.¹ Systematic posting of essays on the World Wide Web is now widely regarded as "publication". Consider, for instance, Moojan Momen’s commentary “A Change of Culture”, published on H-Bahai on 15th February 2003.² Significant references to the Faith appear in the literature of religious studies and the social sciences generally, as well as in current affairs literature. However, there is also an increasing volume of scholarship published on the web only.³

The rapid emergence of electronic information services is revolutionising access to information on the Bahá’í Faith. Electronic sources range from websites that are freely accessible, to journal databases and full-text books available only by subscription, to discussion groups that allow researchers to communicate back and forth. By combining these sources the researcher may learn not only of such traditional sources of scholarly information as books and academic papers, but of such other sources as news services and newspaper articles. Judicial and other official records such as those of the United Nations Organisation are also becoming available, as are book lists supplied by booksellers. A search at the on-line bookstore "Amazon.com" in March 1999, for example, found 264 references to "Bahá’í", 304 references the following October, and 1,681 in April 2007. A CD ROM from Newsbank called REDEX has an "Index to UN Documents" which when

¹ A project to survey current Bahá’í literature, the "Report on Scholarship" (three editions, 1997, 1998 and 1999) are online at http://www.bahai.org.au/abs/reptof98.htm and on the Bahá’í-library.org website.
² And numerous others, such as "A Fragmentary Contribution to the Biography of Taj al-Saltana” posted to H-Bahai by R. Jackson Armstrong-Ingram on 12th December 2002.
³ See, for instance, an article by Said Amir Arjomand Islam, Politics, and Iran in Particular.
searched in March 1999 yielded 209 references to "Bahá’í". A search in the EBSCO database, in the "World Magazine Bank" file, yielded 107 references.

I find it extraordinary that I now have the opportunity to search a database such as FirstSearch and learn that author D.C. Lewis referred to the Bahá’ís of Tartarstan in an article that appeared in the journal Central Asian Survey in 1997, or to find in America: History and Life a reference to an article in the Armenian Review quoting “newly discovered English-Language materials” of Dr Reuben Darbinian of Boston, which:

Presents the concluding extract from the daily journals of Dr. Reuben Darbinian, the edito-in-chief of the Harenik publications of Boston; the entries from November 1931 through April 1932 cover daily life and thoughts on Bahá’í and foreign relations.

This search capacity is quite extraordinary, even if now taken for granted. In an earlier period, “publication” referred to the physical printing of “hard-copy” books, newspapers, pamphlets, magazines, theses, official reports, and academic journals. This printed literature was accessed by browsing through collections in libraries and bookstores, card catalogues, printed indexes, and archives. Information deemed useful by a researcher was then either copied out by hand or “photocopied” page by page. In some cases, access to such institutions was limited by membership, such as being a student or faculty member of a university, or by being recognised as a legitimate researcher by an institutional archive. The most open form of search and retrieval in this phase was through purchase of materials into one’s personal collection, or through visiting a public library. Of course, in the context of such limited access, researchers had minimal access to “official” records of governments or other agencies. Search projects from this period include E.G. Browne’s Materials for the study of the Babi Religion and Momen’s survey of “Contemporary Western Accounts” of the

---

4 Lewis, D.C., “Ethnicity and religion in Tatarstan and the Volga-Ural region”, Central Asian Survey 16, no.2 (1997) p. 215-236. Abstract: This paper explores the link between religion and ethnic identity among the Tatars people of Tatarstan and the Volga-Ural region. It traces the history of Islam, Russian Orthodoxy, paganism, and the Bahá’í faith in this area, highlighting periods of conflict including current tensions between Tatar Muslim nationalists and some Protestant groups. The paper provides detailed statistics of the geographical distribution of ethnic groups within Tatarstan focusing mainly on the indigenous peoples of the Volga-Ural region, and concludes that one widespread legacy of Communism is that many people find it easier to call themselves atheists than anything else.


Bábí and Bahá’í Religions; the premier bibliography of the period is Collins’ *Bibliography of English Language works on the Babi and Bahá’í Faiths*. In a second phase of access, catalogues were computerised and made available at site-specific locations, particularly institutional and academic libraries. Access to full-text documents shifted from such technologies as micro-fiche to “digitized” images. The rapid emergence of general access to the internet then made possible not only the “online” interrogation of computerised catalogues, but the retrieval of full text articles whether in “read-only” or “Optical Character Recognition” (OCR) format. The significance of OCR technology is that a researcher can now by-pass manually constructed catalogues and indexes, and seek any “string” (ie, sequence of letters and symbols) imaginable, across a range of “platforms” (ie, software programs that provide an interface between digital text and the reader – such as html, Adobe’s PDF, or Microsoft Word).

The practical effect of this technological advance is that the researcher may now find obscure (or not so obscure) references of interest that have evaded previous detection (At this stage we are setting aside the issue of “quality” in search results; a discussion of quality versus quantity of search results will follow). A large number of “Bahá’í” references are in one sense “small” and inconsequential. Yet even the smallest inclusion of a reference can represent a significant shift on the part of an author. A second issue concerns the ‘boundaries’ of Bahá’í literature, which potentially includes literature by Bahá’ís, or concerning Bahá’í themes, which does not make explicit Bahá’í references. Note, for instance, Frank Lewis’ study of Rumi; Andy Knight’s studies on the United Nations system and international order; Danesh Sarooshi’s works on international law; Bill Huitt’s encyclopaedia entry on “moral education”, etc. The question can similarly be asked about scientists whose work is “Bahá’i-inspired”.

Search

---


14 The examples would extend to every field of science: in Management one can think of the work of Kambiz Maani’s learning organization and Mehrdad Baghai’s publications on organizational growth.
It is now possible to keep track of references in print media through e-tracker, Lexis-Nexis, Westlaw, etc., and in discussion groups (e.g. through Dejanews); full text retrieval of articles is available through such subscription services as “Expanded Academic” and such electronic libraries as Ebrary and Questia. It is possible to monitor closely the activities of the Bahá’í International Community in the various agencies of the United Nations Organization; and it is possible to track the work of Bahá’í institutions, whether schools and institutes, individual scholars, scholarship portals (e.g. Bahá’í Faith Index, Bahá’í Library), and associations for Bahá’í Studies. In sum, the search capacities currently unfolding present exciting opportunities for bringing together extremely diverse and seemingly esoteric but potentially crucial and invaluable information in the service of scholarship. Electronic sources are being supplemented both forwards and backwards in time. This means that older publications are gradually becoming indexed. Commonly used web browsers remain Internet Explorer and Firefox – however, regardless of choice of browser, the researcher should customise with add-ons, commencing with the “Google toolbar”, and if using Firefox, selected journal search add-ons are available.

Library catalogues

Traditionally, library catalogues comprised cards that could be searched by author, title, and subject. Some large libraries printed their catalogues in book form so as to enable searches from beyond their physical location, wherever such printed catalogues were placed. I first encountered the “facsimile” of the British Museum’s card catalogue in the Michael Somare Library of the University of Papua New Guinea. The catalogues of most libraries are now searchable online and while the most common way to do this is to first visit the library’s website, bibliographic software such as Endnote facilitate this without the need to visit the website directly. Libraries that deploy what is known as the “Z39” protocol have “opened up” their catalogues to such searching. The Zetoc database, for instance provides Z39.50-compliant access to the British Library’s Electronic Table of Contents (ETOC), allowing search through the contents of approximately 20,000 current journals and 16,000 conference proceedings published per year:

“With around 20 million journal and conference records, the database covers every imaginable subject in science, technology, medicine, engineering, business, law, finance and the humanities. Around 100,000 of the journals included are available for electronic data delivery (EDD) download. The database covers the years from 1993 to date and is updated daily. A list of journal titles covered by the database is available. Copies of all the articles and conference papers listed on the database can be ordered online from the British Library's Document Supply Centre in Yorkshire.”
The accompanying graphic shows a search being conducted using Endnote. While online, I have connected to the library catalogue at Temple University and conducted a search for materials catalogued with the term “Baha’i” in any field. This search yielded 95 entries for materials dating between 1911 and 2006.

**Publication catalogues**

**Serial and subject indexes**
Serial indexes may index an individual serial or multiple serials. *America: History and Life, African Studies, and Canadian Periodical Index* typify titles devoted to the indexing of serials from geographic regions, while *Arts and Humanities Citation Index, Combined Retrospective Index to Journals in Sociology 1895-1974, vol.3: Subjects,* and *Religious & Theological Abstracts* exemplify serial indexes devoted to specific fields and disciplines.

I have inspected at least 136 such serial indexes which, over a period of time, have become subsumed in the larger electronic libraries and for the most part discontinued as distinct hard-copy publications.

The advent of digital libraries, which enable full text searching within serials, has rendered serial and subject indexes obsolete – apart, of course, from indexes to materials not yet online. Services of interest include in *ATLA Religion Database + ATLAS,* which holds records from 1949 to the present. A search in this database on February 18, 2002 for the term ‘Bahá’í’ yielded 439 records; a search through *Hein Online - the modern link to legal history* on 4th August 2003 found Bahá’í references in 27 volumes; while a search in the *Periodicals Contents Index Web,* 15th February 2002, yielded 25 references in English, German and Italian.

**Dissertation Indexes**

Various degree qualifications at tertiary institutions require their students to submit a dissertation (also known as a thesis). Dissertation indexes seek to compile lists of completed theses. Within academic environments, there are also departmental publications which have a low volume of circulation and minimal accessibility. Whereas theses are becoming more accessible through indexes, it is still possible to find unique citations in specific university catalogues. In March 2003, for instance, I found while searching the library catalogue at Northwestern University in Evanston, Illinois, the hard-copy Master’s thesis “Bahá’í - a Study in Planned Syncretism” by Benson.

---

15 A July 2001 search was conducted using “Silver Platter” ERL Webspirs. The “database guide” at gives the following information About ATLA Religion Database + ATLAS: “ATLA Religion Database + ATLAS is produced by the American Theological Library Association's Center for Electronic Resources in Theology and Religion. The ATLAS (American Theological Library Association Serials) project was created for religion scholars by religion scholars. It provides online versions of the entire runs of a core collection of more than fifty significant scholarly periodicals in the field of religion, most of which go back to 1949. ATLAS journals represent a wide selection of Christian traditions (including Catholic, Orthodox, Protestant, Evangelical, and Pentecostal), Islam, Judaism, Buddhism, Hinduism, Shinto, Taoism, Confucianism, and other religious traditions.”

16 Described as “the most comprehensive index to journals in the Humanities and Social Sciences, a Chadwyck-Healey publication from ProQuest Information and Learning Company: [http://pef1.chadwyck.co.uk](http://pef1.chadwyck.co.uk).

17 These are set out here for interest: Rosenkranz, Die Baha‘i (Book Review) Journal Section(s): Besprechungen Citation: *Theologische Literaturzeitung* 77 (1952) 79 Moojan Momen, The Bab‘i and Bahá’í Religions 1844-1944 (Book Review) Author: Schumann, *Olaf Journal Section(s):* Literatur Citation: *Welt des Islams* n.s.:25 (1985) 237 H. M. Balyuzi: Edward Granville Browne and the B ahá’í Faith (Book Review) Author: Ess, J. van Journal Section(s): Literatur/Literature Citation: *Welt des Islams* n.s.:14 (1973) 230

18 Benson, B. T. (1956). *Bahai - a Study in Planned Syncretism.* Evanston, Ill., Northwestern University: 206
While dissertation indexes were formerly in hard-copy only, a number of online dissertation indexing projects now exist. Hard copy dissertation indexes include the Comprehensive Dissertation Index, Dissertation Abstracts International: A The Humanities and Social Sciences; Doctoral Dissertations; and American Doctoral Dissertations; Index to Theses accepted for higher degrees by the Universities of Great Britain and Ireland; and Union List of Higher Degree Theses in Australian Libraries. One innovative project to expand digital access to theses is the “Networked Digital Library of theses and dissertations”. A search at this site in April 2007 yields 45 theses having a Bahá’í reference.

Bibliographies

Typically, Babi and Bahá’í references are found in bibliographies of religion and of countries. To date, I have inspected 92. This is in addition to the bibliographies devoted to Bahá’í literature, the main ones being those by Bjorling19, Collins20 (Collins 1990), and Stockman and Winters21 (Stockman and Winters 1997), with an earlier contribution by Braun22. The Resource Guide for the Scholarly Study of the Bahá’í Faith is online, while additional bibliographies of Bahá’í materials have been gathered by Jonah Winters at http://bahai-library.com/resources/

Archives

Archives collect documents and other artefacts that may not exist in published form. Traditionally, the contents of such collections were accessible only those able to visit the archive’s physical location. The advent of online catalogues allows for off-site searching of contents, if not of the documents and artefacts themselves. In January 2003 a “World Association for Bahá’í libraries and archives” was established at a conference at Landegg, Switzerland. Although this initiative has not been followed up sufficiently, it provides the groundwork for later development of policies and procedures for the organization of materials held by Bahá’í communities and institutions. While the major portion of significant archival materials are stored in the archives of National Assemblies and at the Bahá’í World Centre, other archives do hold materials of interest.23

20 Collins, Bibliography
23 A search by web at the National Union Catalogue of Manuscript Collections (NUCMC) points to archival materials having Bahá’í Content in fourteen repositories: The Archives of American Art, Smithsonian Institution, the Johns Hopkins University Special Collections, in Baltimore, Dept. of Special Collections, Stanford Univ. Libraries, Stanford, CA; Presbyterian Historical Society, Philadelphia; Manuscripts & Archives Section, The New York Public Library; Princeton University Library; the National Bahá’í Archives (Wilmette, Ill.); University of Utah Marriott Library; University of Washington Libraries (Seattle); Union Theological Seminary, Burke Library, New York; DeWitt Historical Society of Tompkins County, Clinton House, 116 North Cayuga Street, Ithaca, New York; and the Division of Rare and Manuscript Collections, Cornell University Library.
Search engines

General

Simple searching is achieved through ‘open source’ searching of the World Wide Web. Most internet users are familiar with Google, Yahoo, and many other such search engines. Each has its strengths and weaknesses as a search tool. General search engines can be helpful if one is seeking broad information about Bahá’í communities and their activities; more specialised engines are required if one is looking for information from scholarly, or more authoritative, sources. Current information about what search engines and technologies are available is easily found, ironically, but writing a direct query into one’s current browser search facility.

24 There are even specialised websites at www.searchengines.com and http://www.searchenginewatch.com
Specialized

There are specialised search engines and also meta-search engines. A specialised search engine will focus, for example, on providing results for a particular country, or for a specific subject area, or from within a specific news-source such as newspapers, or official documents. “Google Scholar”, for instance, provides for searches from within scholarly materials, rather than from the WWW generally.

There are also “meta-search” engines such as Copernic (www.copernic.com), which combine the results from multiple searches into one consolidated results list. The professional edition of this software (Copernic Agent Professional) allows the researcher to nominate the target for searches as well as the frequency. It is possible to search, for instance, on a daily, weekly or monthly basis, for Bahá’í references within news sources for Australia, or Brazil, or the UK, to name a few. Searching databases on the WWW are another branch of specialised search. Such resources are sometimes called the “hidden web” since an ordinary search may find the homepage of a database, but does not have the capacity to enter into the database to find specific resources. See, for example, the information.

Alerts and intelligent agents

Alert services allow the researcher to nominate topics about which he or she seeks notification. When the nominated topic appears within a product of the information provider, the researcher can receive special notification – usually by email. Such alert services are provided by digital libraries such as...
Proquest, periodical publishers such as Blackwell, book sellers (new and used) such as Amazon.com, and news aggregators such as “Google News”. The accompanying graphic shows the latest alert from Proquest, showing three articles containing a Bahá’í reference.

The British Library’s “zetoc Alert” is an example of a current awareness service that can be requested to email alerts on specific keywords. It emails tables of contents of targeted journals or details of articles which match some pre-defined search criteria such as an author’s name or keywords from the title. These email Alerts are sent on the day the new data is loaded into the database.25

“Intelligent Agents” undertake customised internet searches and automatically return the results to the searcher. Some agents are available for free subscription, while those having more sophisticated capacities are available for purchase or subscription. The powerful software Copernic Agent is a meta-search tool that can retrieve searches in specialised areas of the internet according to a pre-set schedule.

Homepages

In the past decade a significant quantity of information on Bahá’í communities has been posted on the world wide web. Significant portals include bahai-library.org,26 H-Bahai, Bahaindex.com and the official site www.bahai.org. The religious press now has dedicated websites and search engines, and such sources can track Bahá’í references at such events as, for instance, the Parliament of the World’s Religions. For instance, Kung and Kuschel’s report of Bahá’í participation in the signing of a “Global Ethic” at the World Parliament of Religions which met in Chicago in 199327 was reported in an article on “Women's multifaith perspectives on global child advocacy” in 2000.28 The third international meeting of the Parliament of the World’s Religions, held in Cape Town in December 1999, was subject to articles exploring ecumenism: Ruether reported that there were probably more members of the Bahá’í and the Mormons than Methodists present.29 Calame notes the participation of the Bahá’í community in an initiative to draft a charter for a “responsible, plural and united world”.30

---

26 Bahá’í academic resource library is described in the “Humbul Humanities Hub” as “…one of the best all-round introductory sites to the Bahá’í faith available anywhere on the Web.” Catalogued by Jeff Dubberley on 2001-09-29(accessed 21 March 2002).
Associations for Bahá’í Studies

There are now at least twenty Associations for Bahá’í Studies worldwide31, some of which maintain homepages.32 A few, but not all, of their homepages provide bibliographic information about their respective publications.

Bahá’í communities

The websites of Bahá’í communities are listed at numerous sites on the web. Two comprehensive sites are www.bcca.org and www.bahaidirectory.org, while of course Casper Voogt’s site, www.bahaindex.com, is an invaluable source for all manner of information on Bahá’í communities and activities. Entire websites can be copied using such freely available software tools as winHTTrack. Individual pages can be selectively copied with such commercially available software as Web Research Professional.

Official Documents

Official documents include statutes, court judgements, and very many other types of bureaucracy-generated documentation. A search on the Lexis database on January 24, 2003 (Commonwealth and Irish Cases, Combined - Grouped by Country – Bahá’í) yielded 85 references; numerous judgements from US courts have Bahá’í references; the findings of all Australian judicial environments are searchable over the internet (austlii.com.au), including refugee and immigration tribunals, which are a particularly fruitful source of information. A significant number of references in official documents at all levels of the US government can be found by searching firstgov.gov. United Nations Documents are a fertile source of Bahá’í references. The holdings of the United Nations Dag Hammarskjöld Library are available through UNBISnet - Bibliographic Search. A significant number of documents are available through careful searching at the UN site: www.un.org

Digital libraries

Most internet-based databases are only available through subscription. They may be better described as ‘portals’ through which a far greater number of individual databases are made available. Some of these individual titles are accessible through a number of databases or portals, and quite a few commenced long before the Internet age. The database FirstSearch, for instance, includes a large subset of discipline-specific databases. A search on

31 The internet addresses for these associations are listed at such sites as http://www.bahai-studies.org/ and http://www.bahai-studies.ca/affiliates.php
32 An incomplete list of Associations for Bahá’í Studies includes Africa; Australia; Chile; United Kingdom; French Speaking Europe; German Speaking Europe; India; Japan; Malaysia; New Zealand; North America; Northern Mariana Islands; Persian Language; Philippines; Russia; Singapore; and Venezuela

The accompanying graphic shows a search for “Bahá’í” in the commercially available library, Questia (www.questia.com). This search on 5th April 2007 yielded 439 references within the full-text of books.
Off-line searching

Computer-based searching need not take place on-line, as there are an increasing number of software applications that provide searchable interfaces. These include Mars, Immerse, Bahá’í Library, and Ocean. Books, and even the historic periodical Star of the West, are now available on cd-rom: (2001).
Implications for search

All of the sources for searching for Baha’i materials and references noted above suggest that the field of possibilities is expanding exponentially. The serious researcher must keep track of search activities completed to ensure minimal duplication of effort at a later date. To store references and materials, bibliographic software is essential. I use Endnote, although other packages are also available. In addition to capturing references with this bibliographic software, I record searches in an Excel file.

Tabs are used in Excel for different categories of search (such as alert services, bibliographies, bookshops, dissertation indexes, search engines, etc) and on each tabbed page a list is kept of the site searched, the date of search, and the number of references found.

Although source materials for Bahá’í scholarship are becoming more accessible a range of resources that are essential to Bahá’í scholarship including Bahá’í journals, out of print books, and much primary data, remain hard to access. Despite the recent expansion of access there remains no central indexing system, no central clearing house, and there is need for a systematic project to compile a Bahá’í bibliography on global scale.

Partial Bibliography of Literature on the Baha’i Faith 2003-2006


Anon (2003). "Go-ahead for Baha‘i $1m hall." *Australasian Business Intelligence*.


Anon (2003). "Bahais choose Toronto architect for Temple in Chile."


Philosophy and the Baha'i Revelation. Hong Kong, Juxta Publishing Ltd.


